



Joint Report Submission to the Committee against Torture
80th Session (8 July and 26 July 2024)
For the consideration of the Türkiye's fifth periodic report

Solidarity With Others AISBL Brussels (OTHERS)
and
International Networks Against Cyber Hate (INACH)
June 2024

Table of Contents

Introduction.....	3
A. Contribution of Hate Speech to an Environment of Torture.....	3
B. ‘FETÖ’ Hate Speech.....	5
C. Sources of Hate: Hate Campaigns Originating from Ruling / Opposition Party Leaders and distributed by Media.....	6
C.1 Hate Campaigns Originating from Politics.....	6
C.2 Examples of ‘FETÖ’ Hate Speech by Ruling and Opposition Party Leaders.....	6
C.3 Hate Campaign Distributed by Traditional and Social Media.....	9
C.4 Examples of “FETÖ” Hate Speech Distributed by Media.....	9
D. The Effect of Decree Laws : Ongoing Discrimination Against Victims in Public and Private Sectors.....	12
D.1 Discrimination Cases in Public Sector.....	12
D.2 Discrimination Cases in Private Sector.....	15
E. Potential For Spread Beyond Türkiye.....	16
E.1 Hate crime and discrimination examples :.....	16
E.2 Examples of “FETÖ” Hate Speech.....	17
F. State Policies Promoting Torture and Ill-Treatment.....	18
F.1 Turkey Tribunal.....	19
G.Conclusion and Recommendations.....	19

Introduction

1. Solidarity With Others in Brussels (OTHERS) and International Networks Against Cyber Hate (INACH) thank the Committee against Torture (Committee) for its engagement with civil society and for providing this opportunity to be associated in the process of considering the periodic report of Türkiye. **OTHERS** is an international non-governmental organization established in Brussels with the aim of defending and promoting human rights in Türkiye and elsewhere. OTHERS has also been working on hate speech and hate crime project for more than four years. **INACH** is the leading network within the EU and globally that combats cyber hate using a holistic approach that combines monitoring, content removal, educational methods, international cooperation, advocacy and cutting-edge technology. With its 34 members from 27 countries, INACH is at the forefront of addressing the issue of online hate speech and bringing the online in line with human rights. INACH promotes online respect, responsibility and citizenship by countering cyber hate, extremism and violence incitement and by raising awareness about online discrimination. We actively reinforce human rights and mutual respect for the rights and reputations of all internet users, securing a safer internet.
2. The aim of this report is to shed light on the prevalence and impact of hate incidents, including hate speech, hate crimes, and discrimination cases targeting the Gulen movement in Türkiye over the period from 2020 to 2024. Under Article 16¹ of the Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman, or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CIDT)², state parties are obligated to prevent acts of cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment or punishment that do not amount to torture. By documenting and analyzing these patterns, the report seeks to highlight the urgent need for measures to protect people affiliated with Gulen movement and ensure accountability for actions that perpetuate a cycle of violence and abuse. In line with Article 16, this report aims to provide the Committee with detailed, credible evidence to support efforts to combat systemic discrimination and hate incidents and promote human rights in Türkiye, emphasizing the necessity of preventing cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment or punishment in any form.
3. This report also aims to bring to the knowledge of the Committee the crackdown on Gülen Movement, its members and perceived members sympathizers since 2013 in Türkiye.
4. OTHERS and INACH submit the present report for the considerations of the Committee Against Torture during the examination of the State party report of Türkiye in the framework of the 80th session of the Committee which will take place between 8 July and 26 July 2024³.

A. Contribution of Hate Speech to an Environment of Torture

5. Hate speech in Türkiye between 2020 and 2024 has been instrumental in creating a hostile and dangerous environment for minority groups, particularly the Gulen movement. Reports from organizations like Human

¹ 1. Each State Party shall undertake to prevent in any territory under its jurisdiction other acts of cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment which do not amount to torture as defined in article I, when such acts are committed by or at the instigation of or with the consent or acquiescence of a public official or other person acting in an official capacity. In particular, the obligations contained in articles 10, 11, 12 and 13 shall apply with the substitution for references to torture of references to other forms of cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment.

2. The provisions of this Convention are without prejudice to the provisions of any other international instrument or national law which prohibits cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment or which relates to extradition or expulsion.

² <https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/cat.pdf>

³ CAT - Convention against Torture and Other Cruel Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment, 80 Session (08 Jul 2024 - 26 Jul 2024), available [here](#)

Rights Watch⁴ and Amnesty International⁵ indicate a troubling correlation between the prevalence of hate speech and the rise in instances of torture and ill-treatment. Political leaders have often used incendiary language to delegitimize and demonize the group, which has been echoed and amplified by both state-controlled and independent media. The impact of hate speech extends beyond mere words; it actively contributes to systemic human rights abuses⁶. As highlighted by the United Nations' strategic frameworks⁷, hate speech is a precursor to more severe forms of violence, including torture.

6. The Turkish government's crackdown on the Gülen movement indeed exemplifies many stages of the Pyramid of Hate⁸, an analytical framework developed by the Anti-Defamation League (ADL) to describe escalating levels of hate incidents. Since the failed coup attempt in July 2016, the Turkish government, led by President Recep Tayyip Erdoğan, has targeted the Gülen movement extensively, leading to severe human rights violations that closely align with the steps of the Pyramid of Hate.
7. At the base level, the crackdown began with widespread bias and stereotyping, branding the movement as a terrorist organization and its members as traitors. This initial phase involved an extensive media campaign orchestrated by the Turkish government⁹, which painted the members of Gülen movement as the architects of the failed coup attempt in July 2016. This campaign effectively dehumanized members of the movement, fostering a societal narrative that justified subsequent hate crimes and discriminatory actions. Public statements from government officials and pro-government media labeled Gülen movement supporters as "enemies of the state" and "terrorists" under "FETÖ"¹⁰ label creating a hostile environment that paved the way for mass arrests¹¹, job dismissals¹², and social ostracization of those affiliated with the movement. Such rhetoric not only intensified public animosity but also legitimized severe human rights violations under the guise of national security.
8. Furthermore, the direct connection between hate speech and torture is also evident in the psychological impact on victims and their communities¹³. The stress and fear generated by hate speech create an environment where individuals are more likely to experience and report mental health issues, further exacerbating their vulnerability.¹⁴ This psychological toll is compounded by the physical risks, creating a comprehensive environment of torture that permeates the daily lives of targeted community. Addressing

⁴ <https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2024> , <https://www.hrw.org/world-report/2024>

⁵ <https://www.amnestyusa.org/countries/india/> , <https://www.amnesty.org.au/ethiopia-sweeping-emergency-powers-and-alarming-rise-in-online-hate-speech-as-tigray-conflict-escalates/>

⁶ It is available [here the communication](#) submitted to the Office of the Prosecutor of the International Criminal Court by The International Federation for Human Rights (FIDH) drawing the Court's attention to the criminal nature of hate speech in Russian media that has fueled international crimes in Ukraine, and seeking to compel the Prosecutor's Office to apply for arrest warrants.

⁷ UN Strategy and Plan of Action is available [here](#)

⁸ <https://www.adl.org/resources/tools-and-strategies/pyramid-hate> student edition #: ~:text=URL%3A%20https%3A%2F%2Fwww.adl.org%2Fresources%2Ftools,100 , <https://ccej-sfu.ca/teaching/pyramid-of-hate/>

⁹ For texts containing hate speech on Turkish media between 2016 and 2020 : <https://en.nefretsucu.com/>

For statistics by years : <https://en.nefretsucu.com/statistics>

¹⁰ Detailed information is under the next title of "FETÖ" Hate Speech

¹¹ For UK Home Office report : <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/turkey-country-policy-and-information-notes/country-policy-and-information-note-gulenist-movement-turkey-february-2022-accessible-version> , for US Department of State country report on Terrorism 2021

<https://www.state.gov/reports/country-reports-on-terrorism-2021/turkiye>

¹² For US Department of State 2021 Country Reports on Human Rights Practices Turkey :

<https://www.state.gov/reports/2021-country-reports-on-human-rights-practices/turkey/> , <https://www.dw.com/en/turkey-lifts-state-of-emergency-but-fear-of-repression-lingers/a-44711201>

¹³ Special Rapporteur Report on psychological torture and ill-treatment :

<https://documents.un.org/doc/undoc/gen/g20/070/73/pdf/g2007073.pdf?token=7qu9F6I9YNQjOTXnvd&fe=true>

¹⁴ Countering Effects of the "FETÖ" Label Against the Hizmet/Gulen Movement People Living in Canada : <https://northernjusticewatch.org/2024/02/23/countering-effects-of-the-feto-label-against-the-hizmet-people-living-in-canada/>

hate speech, therefore, is not only about preventing physical acts of violence but also about safeguarding the mental well-being and human dignity of all individuals.

9. The next level, acts of violence, became evident through documented cases of torture, inhumane treatment, and enforced disappearances. Many detainees reported severe mistreatment, including beatings, electroshock, and threats of sexual violence¹⁵. The escalation continued with violence against individuals such as arbitrary arrests and extrajudicial killings. Notably, the state has also engaged in transnational repression, abducting and forcibly returning Gülen supporters from other countries¹⁶.
10. While it cannot be categorized as a genocide in the traditional sense, some experts argue that the systematic persecution and efforts to eradicate the movement's presence constitute a form of "social genocide."¹⁷
11. **OTHERS and INACH have concerns that the widespread use of hate speech against the Gülen movement in Turkey from 2020 to 2024 has considerably contributed to an environment favorable to torture and severe human rights violations.**

B. 'FETÖ' Hate Speech

12. The use of the term "Fetö" to refer to the Gulen movement should be considered hate speech because it is a highly negative and pejorative term that demonizes the movement and its members. The term is used as an abbreviation of "Fethullahist Terrorist Organization," and implies that the movement is a criminal and violent organization.
13. On the other hand, in the context of the ongoing human rights violations and restriction of freedom of expression in Türkiye, it is important to note that the term "Fetö" which is used to describe the Gülen movement, is not a legal and legitimate term used by courts to describe an alleged terrorist organization. This term has turned into a hate speech used in all areas of life, including political debates, personal feuds, and even in daily conversations. It has been weaponized by the government and its supporters to silence dissent, justify repression and discrimination against individuals and groups who are perceived to be associated with the movement. The use of this term has resulted in the stigmatization of individuals and groups and has led to serious human rights violations. The UN should take this into consideration when assessing the situation in Türkiye.
14. Furthermore, the use of the term "Fetö" has been weaponized as a tool for hate speech, being used to justify discrimination, stigmatization and violence against individuals and groups associated with the movement. This has led to a climate of fear, censorship and repression, and has had a detrimental impact on the enjoyment of human rights, including the rights to freedom of expression, peaceful assembly, and association.
15. In addition, the use of the term "Fetö" has been used to justify the violation of the rights of the families of those targeted, including the right to education, work, and property, and has led to the forced displacement

¹⁵ <https://stockholmcf.org/uk-home-office-report-highlights-persecution-of-gulen-movement-in-turkey/>

¹⁶ UK Home Office Report : <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/turkey-country-policy-and-information-notes/country-policy-and-information-note-gulenist-movement-turkey-february-2022-accessible-version>

¹⁷ Turkic Educators And Students Breaking Their Silence: An Oral History Of A Tangled Web Of Political Power by Kari L. O'Rourke : https://mospace.umsystem.edu/xmlui/bitstream/handle/10355/97761/ORourke_umkc_0134D_12079.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y

of many individuals and families. As noted in the Northern Justice Watch report¹⁸, this stigmatization has extended beyond Türkiye, affecting the diaspora in countries like Canada, where individuals associated with the Hizmet movement have faced discrimination and social ostracism. This international dimension of hate speech underscores the widespread and damaging effects of the "Fetö" label.

- 16. OTHERS and INACH are concerned that using the term "FETO" to describe the Gülen movement is hate speech, dehumanizing the movement and its followers by identifying them as terrorists. This derogatory word, which is commonly used in political, social, and everyday situations, has been weaponized by the Turkish government and its allies to crush dissent and legitimize serious human rights crimes.**

C. Sources of Hate: Hate Campaigns Originating from Ruling / Opposition Party Leaders and distributed by Media

C.1 Hate Campaigns Originating from Politics

17. The role of political leaders in perpetuating hate speech and fostering an environment of discrimination and violence in Türkiye between 2020 and 2024 has been significant. Both ruling and opposition party leaders have engaged in rhetoric that targets minority groups, particularly the Gulen movement, contributing to a culture of hostility and intolerance.
18. According to the Hrant Dink Foundation's "Hate Speech and Discrimination in the Turkish Media 2020" report¹⁹, political leaders frequently use derogatory and inflammatory language to describe these groups, framing them as threats to national security and social cohesion. This framing not only legitimizes but also encourages discriminatory and violent behaviors against these minorities.
19. The Council of Europe has also raised concerns about the role of political leaders in spreading hate speech. In its 2022 "Annual Report of the Secretary General: State of Democracy, Human Rights, and the Rule of Law,"²⁰ the Council emphasizes that political leaders in Türkiye have frequently used hate speech to stigmatize and demonize minority groups, creating an environment that fosters violence and discrimination.
- 20. OTHERS AND INACH are apprehensive that the substantial role of political leaders in Türkiye in the perpetuation of hate speech between 2020 and 2024 has exacerbated an environment of violence and discrimination.**

C.2 Examples of 'FETÖ' Hate Speech by Ruling and Opposition Party Leaders

21. While providing a comprehensive list of examples of 'FETÖ' hate speech in Türkiye exceeds the scope of this report, some examples of hate speech are presented below.
22. On 1 October 2023²¹, Recep Tayyip Erdogan, President of The Republic of Türkiye, in his Grand Assembly Speech said that *"FETÖ" scoundrels will not benefit from this decision*-by referring to the Grand Chamber

¹⁸ <https://northernjusticewatch.org/2024/02/23/countering-effects-of-the-feto-label-against-the-hizmet-people-living-in-canada/>

¹⁹ Report is available via <https://hrantdink.org/en/asulis/activities/projects/media-watch-on-hate-speech/3979-on-the-edge-of-elections-how-was-the-discriminatory-discourse-in-politicians-statements-reflected-in-the-press>

²⁰ <https://www.coe.int/en/web/secretary-general/report-2023>

²¹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/grand-assembly-speech-of-president-recep-tayyip-erdogan/>

Yüksel Yalçinkaya v. Türkiye judgment of ECHR²². (source : https://www.youtube.com/live/CWVgtan_t0Q?si=qX3JZE4uo_zRdCVL&t=3320)

23. On 26 April 2024²³, Ali Yerlikaya, Minister of Interior, in his X post said that *we will not tolerate "FETÖ" members.* (source : <https://twitter.com/AliYerlikaya/status/1783029575976394804>)
24. On 17 March 2024²⁴, Gökhan Zan, Workers' Party of Türkiye Hatay Metropolitan Municipality Mayor Candidate, in his X post said that *this time they resorted to the "FETÖist" methods they know best.* (source : <https://twitter.com/GokhanZanResmi/status/1769451191027581377>)
25. On 3 March 2024²⁵, Suat Pamukçu, Ex-PM of Yeniden Refah Party, in his statement said that *they let "FETÖ" into the party, the alliance was opposed by "FETÖ" members in the party.* (source : <https://twitter.com/MediaMuhtari/status/1765644538301817107>)
26. On 20 February 2024²⁶, Devlet Bahçeli, Chairman of the Nationalist Movement Party, in his statement said that *price anarchists are also "FETÖ" members their shops and houses should be closed.* (source : <https://twitter.com/ademyurdagul/status/1759941296511127813>)
27. On 31 January 2024²⁷, Bekir Bozdağ, AKP Deputy Assembly Speaker, in his statelent said *that Fethullah Gülen, the head of the "FETO" terrorist organization, is the head of a terrorist organization and the founder and leader of a terrorist organization.* (source : <https://twitter.com/dokuz8haber/status/1752669895823704097>)
28. On 17 December 2023²⁸, Yılmaz Tunç, Minister of Justice, in his statement said that *December 17-25 was a treacherous coup attempt targeting the government and the national will by members of FETO, which has been insidiously nesting in our state.* (source : <https://twitter.com/yilmaztunc/status/1736323275750363397>)
29. On 4 December 2023²⁹, Ümit Özdağ, Chairman of ZaferParty, in his statement said that *"FETO" is the last crusade.* (source : <https://twitter.com/umitozdog>)
30. On 24 October 2023³⁰, Ali Yerlikaya, Minister of Interior, in his X post said that *we will give no chance to "FETÖ" traitor to recovery.* (source : <https://twitter.com/AliYerlikaya/status/1716736507128500236>)
31. On 28 September 2023³¹, Ministry of Culture and Tourism, in his official X post shared that *the 60th Antalya Golden Orange Film Festival was instrumental in the propaganda of the "FETO" terrorist organization, which is extremely regrettable.* (source : <https://twitter.com/TCKulturTurizm/status/170728695117325144>)
32. On 31 August 2023³², Ali Yerlikaya, Minister of Interior, in his X post said that *We won't give a chance to recovery to "FETÖ" members.* (source : <https://twitter.com/aliyerlikaya/status/1697249058216460515>)

²² [https://hudoc.echr.coe.int/fre#{%22tabview%22:\[%22document%22\],%22itemid%22:\[%22002-14187%22\]}](https://hudoc.echr.coe.int/fre#{%22tabview%22:[%22document%22],%22itemid%22:[%22002-14187%22]})

²³ <https://hatemonitoring.com/statements-of-ali-yerlikaya/>

²⁴ <https://hatemonitoring.com/statements-of-gokhan-zan/>

²⁵ <https://hatemonitoring.com/statements-of-suat-pamukcu/>

²⁶ <https://hatemonitoring.com/statements-of-devlet-bahceli/>

²⁷ <https://hatemonitoring.com/statements-of-bekir-bozdog/>

²⁸ <https://hatemonitoring.com/x-post-of-yilmaz-tunc/>

²⁹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/x-post-of-umit-ozdag/>

³⁰ <https://hatemonitoring.com/x-post-of-ali-yerlikaya/>

³¹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ministry-of-culture-and-tourisms-twitter-x-post/>

³² <https://hatemonitoring.com/ali-yerlikayas-statement-2/>

33. On 12 August 2023³³, Metin Külünk, MP of AKP, in his X post said that former ÖSYM President Ali Demir, who faces 18 years in prison for "FETÖ" membership, continues to work as an academic at Istanbul Technical University. (source : <https://twitter.com/mkulunk/status/1690427555793281025>)
34. On 29 July 2023³⁴, Şamil Tayyar, Journalist and MP of AKP, in his post said that the shortcomings in the fight against "FETÖ"... there is a complete dishonorable "FETÖ" member in front of me. (source : https://x.com/samiltayyar27/status/1685268388388495361?s=48&t=IIHKLf0oUgkMD_SgN7RCyg)
35. On 16 July, Hakan Fidan³⁵, Minister of Foreign Affairs, in his statement said that in the new period, in coordination with our institutions and in effective cooperation with our friends, we will continue to make life unbearable for "FETÖ". (source : <https://www.yenisafak.com/gundem/fetoye-dunyayi-dar-edecemiz-4545599>)
36. On 11 April 2023³⁶, Aytun Çıray, Member of Parliament (MP) from the İYİ Party in İzmir, in his post said that the "FETO" elements that AKP placed in the Turkish Armed Forces, Police and Justice Department had to be cleared (source : <https://x.com/TCAytunCiray/status/1645718866293555201?s=20>)
37. On 31 January, Ümit Özdağ³⁷, Chairman of ZaferParty, in his statement said that "Fetö" is the last crusade", "We will identify and immediately expel the remnants of "Fetö", "Fetö" is more dangerous than the PKK", "Fetö" is an espionage organization", "Fetö" has betrayed us from within and continues to betray us", "Fetö" and "Fetöists" are not Muslims", "Fetö" is the strongest and most effective tool that the Christian world has put forward against Turkishness in the last thousand years", "Fetö" is a network of treason". (source : <https://twitter.com/zaferhabercom/status/1620386922437967872>)
38. On 15 January 2023³⁸, Devlet Bahçeli, Chairman of Nationalist Movement Party, in his statement said that "FETO" members, PKK members, enemies of Turks, elements of destruction, dishonourable people who are servants of foreign powers, and those who have fallen into weakness are trying their last chance. The hope of the putschists is the Alliance of Zillet." (source : <https://www.aa.com.tr/tr/politika/mhp-genel-baskani-bahceli-cumhurbaskanimiz-recep-tayyip-erdoganin-etrafinda-tek-yumruk-olalim/2788063>)
39. On 11 January 2023³⁹, Bekir Bozdağ, ex-Minister of Justice, in his statement said that 8 thousand 725 people were tried in 289 actual coup cases and a total of 4 thousand 891 people were sentenced, 1634 of whom were sentenced to aggravated life imprisonment, 1366 people to life imprisonment and 1891 people were sentenced to term imprisonment. Bozdağ said that 2 thousand 870 of the defendants were acquitted and 964 people were decided not to be sentenced. Bozdağ stated that 203 thousand 511 files with the accusation of "membership of an armed terrorist organisation" within the scope of "FETO" were concluded, the number of pending files was 64 thousand 58, 107 thousand 492 people were tried in the pending files, and 577 thousand 616 people were sentenced in the concluded files. Bozdağ stated that the number of detainees is 1299, the number of people under judicial control is 22 thousand 636, the number of people with arrest warrants is 29 thousand 93 and the number of convicts is 16 thousand 212. (source :

³³ <https://hatemonitoring.com/metin-kulunks-statement/>

³⁴ <https://hatemonitoring.com/samil-tayyars-statement/>

³⁵ <https://hatemonitoring.com/hakan-fidans-statement/>

³⁶ <https://hatemonitoring.com/aytun-cirays-twitter-post/>

³⁷ <https://hatemonitoring.com/umit-ozdags-statement/>

³⁸ <https://hatemonitoring.com/devlet-bahcelis-statement/>

³⁹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/bekir-bozdags-statement/>

40. On 8 January 2023⁴⁰, Ümit Özdağ, Chairman of Zafer Party, in his statement said that Zekeriya "FETO" scoundrel, Turcophobic murderer. We know who you / "FETO" scoundrel spies are working for. You are a member of the last Crusader army. Former partner of AKP Party, soldier murderer, you shamelessly slander as in Ergenekon indictments. Drown in the blood of the officers you martyred." (source : <https://twitter.com/umitozdog/status/1612085785636868096>)
41. On 6 January 2023⁴¹, Süleyman Soylu, ex-Minister of Interior, in his statement said that take Tayyip Erdoğan out of the equation, today "FETÖ" was the ruler of Türkiye. He would do business with America in Türkiye. They would also produce big big words." he answered." (source : <https://www.aa.com.tr/tr/gundem/icisleri-bakani-soylu-bizim-derdimiz-kayyum-atamak-degil/2781208>)

C.3 Hate Campaign Distributed by Traditional and Social Media

42. The ruling party, in particular, has been documented as using state-controlled media to spread its narrative. Human Rights Watch's report, "Türkiye's Hostages: Free Speech and the Judiciary in Türkiye,"⁴² details how government officials have utilized media platforms to broadcast hate speech, which labels members of the Gulen movement as terrorists. This strategy is not only aimed at discrediting political opposition but also at rallying public support by appealing to nationalist sentiments.
43. Research by Kamil Yilmaz provides further insight into the dynamics of hate speech on social media. In his study, "Hate Speech Predicts Engagement on Social Media: A Case Study from Türkiye,"⁴³ Yilmaz analyzes how political leaders' posts containing "FETÖ" hate speech tend to generate higher levels of engagement compared to neutral or positive content. This finding is significant as it indicates that hate speech not only spreads rapidly on social media but also attracts more attention and interaction, thereby reinforcing and amplifying its reach.
- 44. OTHERS and INACH worried by the widespread dissemination of hate speech against the Gülen movement in Türkiye through traditional and social media. The organization underscores that social media platforms are obligated to prevent the dissemination of such hateful content in accordance with the Digital Services Act (DSA) and the EU Code of Conduct on Countering Illegal Hate Speech Online.**

C.4 Examples of "FETÖ" Hate Speech Distributed by Media

45. While providing a comprehensive list of examples of 'FETÖ' hate speech in Türkiye exceeds the scope of this report, some examples of hate speech are presented below.
46. On 6 May 2024⁴⁴, on X account of Yeni Şafak Media Outlet, a post stated that "FETO" fugitive terrorist Adem Yavuz Arslan targets the heroes of July 15 with lies and slander. (source : <https://twitter.com/yenisafak/status/1787374172408037494>)

⁴⁰ <https://hatemonitoring.com/twitter-post-of-umit-ozdag/>

⁴¹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/suleyman-soylus-statement/>

⁴² <https://www.hrw.org/news/2020/10/14/turkey-press-freedom-under-attack>

⁴³ <https://cronfa.swansea.ac.uk/Record/cronfa65074>

⁴⁴ <https://hatemonitoring.com/post-of-yeni-safak-media-outlet/>

47. On 25 April 2024⁴⁵, Nedim Şener, journalist, on his X post said that *either you finish the "FETÖ " or the "FETÖ" will finish you.* (source : <https://twitter.com/nedimsener2010/status/1783474440854016307>)
48. On 3 January 2024⁴⁶, on X account of SOKak ANALiz Media, a post stated that *Security forces caught "FETO" suspects who mixed with irregular immigrants and those who tried to cooperate with terrorist organizations before they crossed the border.* (source : <https://x.com/SOKakANaliz/status/1742435697301074188>)
49. On 15 December 2023⁴⁷, İbrahim Karagül, journalist, on his X post said that *Ugur Mumcu was killed by the Mossad. "FETÖ" members provided logistical support. Israel-"FETÖ"-PKK was the same front then and today.* (source : <https://twitter.com/ibrahimkaragul/status/1735612975375847621>)
50. On 23 November 2023⁴⁸, on the website of Sabah Media Outlet, a news stated that *"FETÖ"cü hain..." "FETOist traitor..."*. (source : <https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2023/11/23/sabah-mehmet-kamisin-ilk-ifadesine-ulasti-darbe-girisiminden-sonra-cesmeye-geldim-o-gunden-beri-burada-yasiyorum>)
51. On 14 November 2023⁴⁹, Levent Gültekin, journalist, in his Youtube video said that *In my eyes, "FETO" is a terrorist organization. It is a tumor that Israel and America put into Türkiye.* (source : <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=i5y60EZGETE>)
52. On 29 July 2023⁵⁰, on X account of Yenişafak Media Outlet, a post stated that *It was revealed that T.Ö, one of the suspects in the armed attack at a market in Esenyurt where two people were killed, was a sympathizer of the terrorist organizations PKK and "FETÖ".* (source : https://twitter.com/Av_OsmanZerey/status/1685660506793598976/photo)
53. On 26 July 2023⁵¹, Nedim Şener, journalist, in his news said that *What bullets from a gun are to the PKK, lies, slander and conspiracies spread through the media are to "FETÖ" members.* (source : <https://www.hurriyet.com.tr/yazarlar/nedim-sener/yksde-215inci-olan-fetocunun-profil-feto-universitede-42304722>)
54. On 10 July 2023⁵², Aydın Ünal, journalist, in his statement said that *a considerable amount of members and their families formed. This mass, which is against the state with their entire families because they lost their jobs or went to prison, poses a potential threat as it stands. That's why, on the 7th anniversary of July 15, we need to resurrect our hatred and resentment against "FETÖ".* (source : <https://twitter.com/KronosHaber/status/1678321090643279873?t=qvA6sa81dtu08G-6OrZQyg&s=08>)
55. On 27 March 2023⁵³, İsmail Saymaz, journalist, in his news written that *whoever bends and twists the law and uses it as a weapon against the opposition, there is bound to be a family member or relative linked to "FETÖ" and "[The brother of the judge] won a scholarship in 2011 and started his PhD programme at the University of Liechester in the UK. After the coup attempt, he was dismissed from his*

⁴⁵ <https://hatemonitoring.com/statements-of-nedim-sener/>

⁴⁶ <https://hatemonitoring.com/x-post-of-sokak-analiz-medya/>

⁴⁷ <https://hatemonitoring.com/x-post-of-ibrahim-karagul/>

⁴⁸ <https://hatemonitoring.com/news-of-sabah-media-outlet/>

⁴⁹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/levent-gultekins-youtube-video/>

⁵⁰ <https://hatemonitoring.com/yeni-safaks-news/>

⁵¹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/nedim-seners-statement/>

⁵² <https://hatemonitoring.com/erdoganin-eski-danismani-unal-fetoye-karsi-kinimizi-yeniden-diriltmemiz-gerekiyor/>

⁵³ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ismail-saymazs-column/>

studies with the Decree Law No. 673 issued on 1 September 2016, along with 157 academics who belonged to, were affiliated with or had contacts with the "FETÖ/PDY" terrorist organisation, which was found to pose a threat to national security among the students subject to the Law No. 1416 on Students to be Sent to Foreign Countries." (source : <https://halktv.com.tr/makale/imamogluna-ceza-veren-hakimin-kardesi-fetocu-cikti-726966>)

56. On 6 March 2023⁵⁴, İbrahim Karagül, Journalist, editor-in-chief of Yenişafak newspaper, in his X post written that "FETÖ" wanted Ekrem to run for President. Akşener imposed Ekrem. Kılıçdaroğlu did not accept. "FETÖ" created the crisis and blackmailed him. But no result was achieved. "FETÖ" took a step back. He agreed to Ekrem's vice presidency. And the table was set again! (source : <https://twitter.com/ibrahimkaragul/status/1632757051884466178>)
57. On 12 February 2023⁵⁵, Nedim Şener, journalist, in his X post written that all of Türkiye is a witness to what "FETÖ" members did to you Haluk. Don't expect an apology from these scoundrels, just remember what was done. Don't let these "FETÖ" scoundrels mention your name." "Apparently, "FETÖ" members were trying to create a perception by giving so-called support to Haluk's efforts. But the game was broken and now they are threatening him openly and secretly. don't feed Haluk Levent to them.(source : <https://twitter.com/nedimsener2010/status/1624892907957239808>)
58. On 30 January 2023⁵⁶, Sabah media outlet, in its news written that the 6-party table did not forget "FETO" in the agreement: Those with KHK will be reinstated. (source : <https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2023/01/30/6li-masa-mutabakatta-fetoyu-de-unutmadi-khklilar-gorevlerine-iade-edilecek>)
59. On 18 January 2023⁵⁷, Sabah media outlet, in its news written that Foreign Ministry cleansed of crypto "FETÖ" members. Nine of the 12 suspects for whom detention warrants were issued in the investigation against "FETÖ's intimate organization in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs were arrested. Eight of the suspects, who were found to be using ByLock, had been dismissed from their jobs at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs due to their links to the organization. 4 suspects were also included in the detention list due to their involvement in the theft of exam questions in the organization's study houses in 2015. (source : <https://www.sabah.com.tr/gundem/2023/01/18/disislerindeki-kripto-fetoculer-temizlendi>)
60. On 16 January 2023⁵⁸, Nedim Şener, journalist, in his article written that the stones are slowly falling into place: At a press conference held at the Grand National Assembly of Türkiye on 28-29-30 September 2022, Özgür Özel of the Republican People's Party (CHP) had slandered me in a way that even FETÖ members had not done so far... In this column on 5 October 2022, I wrote about Özgür Özel in the ByLock correspondence of the members of FETÖ's MIT Secret Structure in 2015, in order for the voters to get to know the deputy group chairman of the party founded by Atatürk closely... HE RAN TO THE DETAINED FETO MEMBERS... Although at first it may seem like a visit made by Özgür Özel out of humanitarian feelings, this was the result of an operation organised by FETÖ members... ÖZGÜR ÖZEL ON BYLOCK... SECRET STRUCTURE OF MIT... FETÖ members' interest in Özgür Özel goes back even before. (source : <https://www.hurriyet.com.tr/yazarlar/nedim-sener/feto-parlatmasi-chpli-ozgur-ozel-42204470>)

⁵⁴ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ibrahim-karaguls-twitter-post/>

⁵⁵ <https://hatemonitoring.com/nedim-seners-twitter-posts/>

⁵⁶ <https://hatemonitoring.com/report-of-sabah-daily/>

⁵⁷ <https://hatemonitoring.com/report-of-sabah-newspaper-2/>

⁵⁸ <https://hatemonitoring.com/nedim-seners-article/>

61. On 16 January 2023⁵⁹, Sözcü media outlet, in its news written that *the Ministry of Interior also included these names in FETÖ's media structure on the list of those wanted for terrorism and announced that those who report the names will be rewarded with money.* (source : <https://www.sozcu.com.tr/2023/gundem/fetonun-medya-yapilanmasi-icin-iade-talebi-listeye-alindilar-7557964/>)
62. On 15 January 2023⁶⁰, İbrahim Karagül, in his X post written that *Michael Rubin is a notorious enemy who works with the Israeli far right and "FETÖ" and calls for a coup in Türkiye. Rubin speaks, Ali Babacan repeats.* (sources : <https://twitter.com/ibrahimkaragul/status/1614688074344337408> , <https://www.trhaber.com/gundem/fren-ali-ile-michael-rubin-ayni-haritada-bulustu-turk-siha-larindan-h83594.html>)

D. The Effect of Decree Laws : Ongoing Discrimination Against Victims in Public and Private Sectors

63. The series of decree laws enacted⁶¹ following the 2016 coup attempt in Türkiye have had profound and long-lasting effects, particularly on individuals accused of affiliations with the Gulen movement. These laws have facilitated widespread purges across various sectors, resulting in the dismissal of tens of thousands of public and private sector employees. The impact of these decree laws continues to perpetuate discrimination against these individuals, severely affecting their employment prospects and economic stability.
64. A comprehensive report by Human Rights Watch titled "Purged Beyond Return: No Remedy for Türkiye's Dismissed Workers"⁶² highlights the extensive scale of these dismissals and the subsequent hardships faced by the victims. The decree laws not only led to immediate job losses but also imposed restrictions that prevent dismissed individuals from securing new employment, particularly in public institutions. Many have been blacklisted, making it nearly impossible to find work in their fields of expertise.
65. The European Commission's 2021 report on Türkiye's progress towards EU accession⁶³ also emphasizes the ongoing discrimination against victims of the decree laws. It notes that the purges have created a climate of fear and uncertainty, where even those not directly targeted are hesitant to associate with dismissed individuals, fearing repercussions. This societal ostracization further entrenches the economic marginalization of the victims.
- 66. In light of the 2016 coup attempt in Turkey, the decree laws have resulted in widespread and persistent discrimination against individuals who are accused of being affiliated with the Gülen movement. OTHERS and INACH are deeply concerned about this issue. The economic stability and employment prospects of tens of thousands of public and private sector employees have been substantially impacted by the dismissal of these employees as a result of these laws.**

⁵⁹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/report-of-the-sozcu-newspaper/>

⁶⁰ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ibrahim-karaguls-twitter-post-2/>

⁶¹ Venice Commission, Opinion on the Provisions of the Emergency Decree Law N° 674 of 1 September 2016 which concern the exercise of local democracy In Turkey, available [here](#) ; Venice Commission, Opinion on the amendments to the Constitution adopted by the Grand National Assembly on 21 January 2017 and to be submitted to a National Referendum on 16 April 2017, CDL-AD(2017)005, 10-11 March 2017, available [here](#); Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights, Situation in Turkey, available [here](#); Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, Allegations of systemic torture and inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment in places of detention in Europe, recitals 6, 9 and 10, available [here](#); according to European Court of Human Rights' (ECtHR) 2023 statistics Turkey topped the list of countries with cases awaiting judgment with 23,397 applications, corresponding to 34.2 percent of the total, available [here](#).

⁶² Report is available via <https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/eur44/9210/2018/en/>

⁶³ Report is available via <https://www.ab.gov.tr/siteimages/birimler/kpb/turkey-report-2021-v2.pdf>

D.1 Discrimination Cases in Public Sector

67. While providing a comprehensive list of examples of hate crime and discrimination cases targeting the members of Gulen movement and its perceived members in Türkiye exceeds the scope of this report, some examples of hate speech are presented below.
68. On 20 August 2023⁶⁴, Ankara University faculty member Assoc. Prof. Dr. Mustafa Kemal Coşkun, who was dismissed with a state of emergency decree-KHK and reinstated after a court ruling, was not given a room by the faculty administration on the ground that his perceived affiliation to Gulen movement. (source : <https://kronos36.news/tr/goreve-iade-edilen-khkli-akademisyene-fakulte-yonetimi-oda-vermedi/>)
69. On 15 August 2023⁶⁵, Yenimahalle District Job Placement Agency branch (İŞKUR) rejected the job application of an earthquake survivor who was dismissed with a state of emergency decree on the grounds that he was “dismissed with a state of emergency decree”. (source : <https://x.com/boldmedya/status/1691541820251987968>)
70. On 11 April 2023⁶⁶, a doctor using the username @umutla_sevgiyle on twitter-X requested a letter of Good Standing from the Ministry of Health. The ministry informed the doctor, who requested the certificate, that the letter couldn't be issued on the ground that she had been dismissed by KHK decree-law. (source : <https://www.boldmedya.com/2023/04/12/saglik-bakanligi-khkli-doktora-iyi-hal-belgesi-vermedi/>)
71. On 8 March 2023⁶⁷, former teacher M.Ç., whose house in Adana was damaged in the earthquake and who was dismissed by OHAL-KHK(state of emergency decree law) wanted to settle in the dormitory of Niğde Directorate Of Credit And Dormitories Agency. Before leaving Adana to go to Niğde, he called the management of Niğde Credit And Dormitories Agency and after receiving the reply that there was a room for him and his family in the dormitory, they prepared and went to Niğde. After receiving directions from the dormitory staff and staying in contact with them throughout the day, M.Ç. and his family completed the registration process on the phone. After the registration, the police checked criminal records[1] (GBT in Turkish) of M. Ç. After a long wait, M.Ç. was not allowed into the dormitory on the grounds that he had been dismissed by the KHK. (source : <https://www.boldmedya.com/2023/03/08/depremzedeye-gbt-uygulandi-khkli-oldugu-icin-yurda-alinmadi/>)
72. On 6 November 2022⁶⁸, Assoc.Prof.Dr.Şadi Aydın was doing archival and scientific researches at Konya Mevlana University which was closed by a decree law after July 15,2016, sent his article to be published to A Journal of Iranology Studies (Doğu Esintileri), an academic journal of Ataturk University. The article was sent to the impartial referees' board by the editor for evaluation and it has been accepted by editor to be published as a positive result of the board's evaluation after a while. Finally, the article was published as the first article in the September 2022, 17th issue of the journal. However, the article was later removed from the journal on the grounds that Assoc. Prof. Dr. Şadi Aydın was dismissed from his post with a decree law.

⁶⁴ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ankara-university-2/>

⁶⁵ <https://hatemonitoring.com/yenimahalle-district-job-placement-agency-iskur/>

⁶⁶ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ministry-of-health/>

⁶⁷ <https://hatemonitoring.com/nigde-directorate-of-credit-and-dormitories-agency/>

⁶⁸ <https://hatemonitoring.com/administration-of-ataturk-university/>

(source : <https://www.boldmedya.com/2022/11/06/mevlanayla-ilgili-makalesi-sansurlenen-doc-dr-sadi-aydin-khk-ile-kapatilan-universitemin-kapisindan-iceri-sokmadilar-arastirmalarima-el-konuldu/>)

73. On 8 September 2022⁶⁹, electrical engineer Tahir Hasan Kartal, who was dismissed by a decree law (KHK) in 2017, applied for a certificate of building supervision expertise issued by the Ministry of Environment, Urbanization and Climate Change. Kartal, who was acquitted after a lawsuit was filed against him, couldn't get the certificate despite meeting all conditions on the ground that he had been dismissed by the decree law. (source : <https://www.boldmedya.com/2022/09/08/bakanlik-beraat-eden-khkli-muhendise-uzmanlik-belgesini-vermedi/>)
74. On 9 October 2022⁷⁰, Gülten Çetin, the wife of dismissed teacher Eyüp Çetin, was denied a disability pension for her 98 percent disabled son Yakup Ali Çetin by the Ministry of Family and Social Services on the ground that she is the wife of a man dismissed by a decree law. (source : <https://www.evrensel.net/haber/471878/hdpli-gergerlioglu-yuzde-98-engelli-cocuga-babasi-khkli-diye-aylik-verilmedi>)
75. On 29 January 2022⁷¹, Sefa Çiftçi, a doctor dismissed by a decree law, was not permitted to enter the Ministry of Health office to submit his documents. (source : <https://www.gazeteduvar.com.tr/khkli-doktora-saglik-bakanligi-binasina-giris-bile-yasak-haber-1551122>)
76. On 27 October 2021⁷², Sivas Provincial Directorate of National Education revoked the school bus driver license of a person who was dismissed from teaching with a state of emergency decree and was acquitted by the court of appeal. (source : <https://www.gazeteduvar.com.tr/khkli-ogretmenin-okul-servis-soforlugu-belgesi-iptal-edildi-haber-1541061>)
77. On 20 November 2020⁷³, the condition of not having been dismissed with the “Decree Laws” has been added to The Scientific And Technological Research Council Of Türkiye (TÜBİTAK) scholarship application requirements. (source: <https://www.indyturk.com/node/275171/haber/t%C3%BCbi%CC%87tak%C4%B1n-burs-ba%C5%9Fvuru-%C5%9Fartlar%C4%B1-aras%C4%B1nda-khkl%C4%B1-olmamak-var-sab%C4%B1ka-kayd%C4%B1-yok>)
78. On 8 October 2020⁷⁴, The Presidency Council of the Grand National Assembly of Türkiye discussed the security regulation at the first meeting of the legislative year. With the amendment, those who were expelled from the Parliament after January 1, 2015 were banned from entering the campus of the Grand National Assembly of Türkiye. (source : <https://www.cumhuriyet.com.tr/haber/devletten-ihrac-edilenler-tbmm-yerleskesine-giremeyecek-1772116>)
79. On 14 May 2020⁷⁵, The Ministry of Treasury and Finance rejected the application of a person who was dismissed from his job with a decree law and has no other income, in order to benefit from the property tax discount. (source : <https://t24.com.tr/haber/hazine-ve-maliye-bakanligi-ndan-khk-liya-vergi-indirimi-yapilamaz-karari-gerekce-devlete-sadakat,878543>)

⁶⁹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ministry-of-environment-urbanization-and-climate-change/>

⁷⁰ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ministry-of-family-and-social-services/>

⁷¹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ministry-of-health-2/>

⁷² <https://hatemonitoring.com/sivas-governorship-provincial-directorate-of-national-education/>

⁷³ <https://hatemonitoring.com/the-scientific-and-technological-research-council-of-turkiye-tubitak/>

⁷⁴ <https://hatemonitoring.com/presidency-council-of-turkish-grand-national-assembly-tbmm/>

⁷⁵ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ministry-of-treasury-and-finance/>

80. On 23 April 2020⁷⁶, G.S, whose husband was dismissed by the State of Emergency Decree Law (OHAL-KHK) and who has a disabled child, applied online to Etimesgut District Governor's Office to receive a thousand liras of aid announced by the government to be given to families in need due to coronavirus. Her application was refused by the district governorship. G.S was also refused in her previous applications for aid on different grounds. (source : <https://www.boldmedya.com/2020/04/23/khkliya-olum-1000-liralik-korona-yardimi-da-yok/>)
81. On 6 April 2020⁷⁷, the application of an entrepreneur who wanted to benefit from the short time working allowance was rejected by the Ministry of Family, Labor and Social Services on the grounds that he was dismissed by a decree law KHK. (source : <https://www.omerfarukgergerlioglu.com/basin/basindan/salgin-zamaninda-bile-ayrimcilik-khkli-esnafa-kisa-calisma-odenegi-verilmedi/15002/>)
82. On 6 February 2020⁷⁸, at Atılım University, a student who was dismissed with a state of emergency decree wanted to pay his spring semester fee. However, while trying to pay, he learned that he would not be able to benefit from the discounts with a warning sign on the screen: "Except for our students dismissed by a decree-law KHK". (source : <https://www.gazeteduvar.com.tr/gundem/2020/02/06/universitede-khkli-ogrenci-ayrimciligi>)
83. On 22 January 2020⁷⁹, when F.K., who was dismissed from his job with the Decree Law, went to the land registry to sell his house, he could not sell his house on the grounds that "there is a risk in your title deed". (source : <https://www.milligazete.com.tr/haber/3603433/khkliya-ev-satmak-da-yasak>)
84. On 9 January 2020⁸⁰, a citizen who was dismissed by a decree law who wanted to take the exam for internship could not take the exam because the application commitment of the 1st term certified public accountancy exam to be held by Chambers of Certified Public Accountants and Sworn-in Certified Public Accountants of Türkiye (TÜRMOB) in Ankara included the condition of not being dismissed by a decree law. (source : <https://www.memurlar.net/haber/878571/khk-lilara-bu-kez-de-mali-musavirlik-engeli.html>)
85. On 9 January 2020⁸¹, N.E., who was tried and convicted for allegedly being a member of the Gülen movement, wanted to sell her/his car after s/he was released from prison. N.E., who went to the notary for sales transactions, could not sell her/his car on the grounds that s/he was on the 'inconvenient' list, although the injunction on her/his assets was lifted. (source : <https://www.indyturk.com/node/115186/haber/arac%C4%B1n%C4%B1-satmak-istedi-noterde-s%C3%BCrprizle-kar%C5%9F%C4%B1la%C5%9Ft%C4%B1-sak%C4%B1ncal%C4%B1-listesinde-oldu%C4%9Fu>)

D.2 Discrimination Cases in Private Sector

86. While providing a comprehensive list of examples of hate crime and discrimination cases targeting the members of Gulen movement and its perceived members in Türkiye exceeds the scope of this report, some examples of hate speech are presented below.

⁷⁶ <https://hatemonitoring.com/etimesgut-district-governors-officer/>

⁷⁷ <https://hatemonitoring.com/ministry-of-family-labor-and-social-services/>

⁷⁸ <https://hatemonitoring.com/council-of-higher-education/>

⁷⁹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/land-registry-office/>

⁸⁰ <https://hatemonitoring.com/chambers-of-certified-public-accountants-and-sworn-in-certified-public-accountants-of-turkey-turmob/>

⁸¹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/notaries-union-of-turkiye/>

87. On 28 December 2023⁸², a person who applied for a job at Türkiye Finans Katılım Bank was not hired on the grounds that he had previously worked at Bank Asya⁸³, although there was no investigation process against him. (source : <https://x.com/yakinplann/status/1740357207823405134>)
88. On 28 January 2021⁸⁴, cash aid given to Ayşe Dabak, who was dismissed from her job with a decree law decree KHK, because her house was severely damaged in the Izmir earthquake, was blocked by Vakıf Bank Izmir Branch on the grounds that 'your name is on the banned list'. (source : <https://aktifhaber.com/gundem/vakifbank-khkli-isme-yapilan-deprem-yardimini-isminiz-yasakli-diye-bloke-etti-h155860.html>)
89. On 13 February 2020⁸⁵, the credit card of N.A., who was dismissed with a decree law, was blocked by Halkbank. (source : <https://www.dw.com/tr/bankadan-khk-yan%C4%B1t%C4%B1-kart%C4%B1-ihra%C3%A7-nedeniyle-kapat%C4%B1ld%C4%B1/a-53363760>)

E. Potential For Spread Beyond Türkiye

90. The patterns of hate speech and discrimination that have been prevalent in Türkiye from 2020 to 2024, particularly targeting the Gulen movement, hold the potential to spread beyond the country's borders. This potential is driven by several factors, including the global nature of media and social media, the diaspora communities, and the geopolitical influence of Türkiye.
91. **OTHERS and INACH are apprehensive that the hate speech and discrimination patterns that were prevalent in Turkey from 2020 to 2024, with a particular emphasis on the Gülen movement, have the potential to extend beyond the country's borders. The international reach and impact of this detrimental rhetoric are evident in the occurrence of hate speech, hate crimes, and discrimination against Gülen movement members in EU member states, the USA, and Indonesia.**
92. Some examples of hate speech, hate crime and discrimination targeting Gulen movement and its members have been seen beyond Türkiye such as in EU member states, in USA and in Indonesia. These examples are as following :

E.1 Hate crime and discrimination examples :

93. On 28 July 2023⁸⁶, to renew his company's communication subscription agreement, Mr. Melik goes to the employees of the O2 company, who have opened a stand in the Media Markt store in the Kauf Park Eiche shopping center in Berlin. There is also a person of Turkish origin among the employees. Mr. Melik requests this person to renew the contract. The officer asks Mr. Melik for his ID. Realizing that the ID is not a citizen's ID but the identity of an immigrant with a residence permit, the officer insults Mr. Melik in Turkish so that his German colleagues do not understand, on the grounds that he is affiliated with the Gülen movement, and the officer does not renew his contract. (source : from the victim by reporting via hatemonitoring.com : <https://hatemonitoring.com/s-a/>)

⁸² <https://hatemonitoring.com/turkiye-finans-katilim-bankasi-s-a/>

⁸³ The bank was notable for its rapid growth and extensive network of branches across Turkey. However, it became embroiled in controversy due to its alleged connections with the Gülen movement, which was accused by the Turkish government of orchestrating the failed coup attempt in July 2016.

⁸⁴ <https://hatemonitoring.com/vakif-bank-izmir-branch/>

⁸⁵ <https://hatemonitoring.com/halkbank-central-operations-department/>

⁸⁶ <https://hatemonitoring.com/s-a/>

94. On 1 May 2022⁸⁷, Ramazan Yilmazer who has been living in Germany for 41 years went to a restaurant to have dinner with his daughter and son-in-law. Upon his entry in the restaurant Yilmazer asked : ‘A person named Yetiş wrote that he started working here, is he still going on ?’. The restaurant owner responded : ‘I fired all of them. The guy was a member of ‘FETÖ’, as you guess he was a terrorist. I have nothing to do with such people.’ Yilmazer replied : ‘I don’t know you but I have known those people for 30 years. Did they assault you; did they attack you with a gun? How can you talk like that?’. Upon this, the perpetrator and his relatives insulted and assaulted the victim on the ground that he is a member of Gülen movement, saying ‘so you are one of them’. Yilmazer, who had a broken tooth as a result of the attack and received a medical report from the hospital and lodged a complaint against the perpetrator R.Y. (source : <https://kronos36.news/tr/turkiyedeki-gulen-cemaati-nefreti-almanyaya-tasindi-terorist-deyip-darp-etti/>)
95. On July 2016, an attempt was made to burn down the Lucerna school in Antwerp⁸⁸, which Gülen movement volunteers made significant contributions to establishing. (source : <https://hizmetpurge.wordpress.com/2016/08/23/500/>)
96. On July 2016, the building and window of Vuslat Ghent office⁸⁹ were stoned by unidentified people and the window of the office was broken. (source : <https://hizmetpurge.wordpress.com/2016/08/23/512/>)

E.2 Examples of “FETÖ” Hate Speech

97. On 16 January 2023⁹⁰, Mustafa Açıkgöz, MP of AKP, in his statement said that *just as we do not give them (referring to Gulen movement and kurdish people) the right to live in Türkiye, we will not give them the right to live in Germany. We will not give them a place in Türkiye. God willing, we have finished them there, wherever they hide in the world, we will bring them out of their hiding places and destroy them.* (source : <https://www.inspiredminds.de/tr/akpli-vekilin-almanyadaki-konu%C5%9Fmas%C4%B1-tepkilere-yol-a%C3%A7t%C4%B1/a-64403966>)
98. On 20 January 2023⁹¹, Mevlüt Çavuşoğlu, ex-minister of Foreign Affairs, during his speech said that *I hope the United States will also extradite "FETO" members and the FBI told us that they saw the dark side of the "FETO" terrorist organisation and that they resorted to all kinds of methods, including human smuggling, irregularities in visas, and money laundering.* (source : <https://www.trtworld.com/americas/t%C3%BCrkiye-expects-us-to-extradite-feto-terrorists-cavusoglu-64687>)
99. On 21 January 2023⁹², Köksal Kuş, Union of European Democrats (UID) Chairman, in his statement said that *the fact that they [Germany] do not recognize “FETÖ” members does not mean much to us... They [“FETÖ” members] are especially effective in the press and social media and they spread them,” “While answering the question asked by our citizens about terrorist organizations, we see that they may have misinterpreted it, perhaps exceeding its purpose,” and “They will resort to all kinds of ways to provoke the elections. Recently, we see that some groups have taken action to provoke the elections and that “FETÖ” members are behind these incidents. They are especially effective in the press and social media and they spread them.* (source : <https://kronos36.news/tr/akpnin-avrupa-kolunun-baskani-koksal-kus-almanyenin-teror-orgutu-tanimamasi-bir-sey-ifade-etmez/>)

⁸⁷ <https://hatemonitoring.com/rifat-yilmaz/>

⁸⁸ <https://hatemonitoring.com/unidentified-3/>

⁸⁹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/unidentified/>

⁹⁰ <https://hatemonitoring.com/akp-mp-mustafa-acikgozs-statement/>

⁹¹ <https://hatemonitoring.com/mevlut-cavusoglus-statement/>

⁹² <https://hatemonitoring.com/koksal-kuss-statement/>

100. On 27 January 2023⁹³, Abdurrahman Şimşek, journalist, in his news said that "FETÖ's" corruptor of religion, treasonous projects, subcontracted by "FETÖ", Vatican-based, umbrella religion, "FETÖ's" mastermind, the project to destroy religion, a fugitive of the organization, "FETÖ" members." (source : <https://www.sabah.com.tr/galeri/gundem/son-dakika-iste-fetonun-din-bozguncusu-sabah-celal-findiki-buldu>)
101. On 14 June 2023⁹⁴, Suat Bezeng, Editor-in-Chief of Aktif TV and Chairman of the Board of Directors of Aktif Media, in his X post said *that to whom did the Minister of Justice hand over the usurped powers of the Islamic Council of Belgium? Look, officially they are not ashamed to reveal their names! I have been saying this for months. Of course, they handed it over to "FETÖ", why? Because "FETÖ" embraces LGBT people. O "FETÖ" clowns, let's see who will go to the mosques you are responsible for? Who will take you for a man and accept the imam you appointed? Let's see if you can admit LGBTI people into the mosques. Let's see if you can appoint a woman imam. Let's see if you can afford it. The ones you take shelter behind (the ones you sit on) will not save you. You will drown with the saliva hanging from your mouth!"* (source : <https://twitter.com/suatbezeng/status/1669079314640388097>)
102. On 22 June 2023⁹⁵, Oktan Erdikmen, Turkish-origin journalist, in his news said that *The Federal Office for the Protection of the Constitution has published its 2022 report⁹⁶. The report mentions Türkiye. Türkiye is listed among the countries involved in espionage activities in Germany, along with Russia, China, Iran, and North Korea. It is noted that there is a particular focus on organizations such as the PKK and "FETÖ".* (source : <https://boldmedya.com/2023/06/22/almanyada-turk-asilli-gazetecinin-nefret-soylemi-tepki-ckti/>)
103. On 16 July 2023⁹⁷, Hakan Fidan, Minister of Foreign Affairs, in his speech said that in the new period, in coordination with our institutions and in effective cooperation with our friends, we will continue to make life unbearable for "FETÖ". (source : <https://www.yenisafak.com/gundem/fetoye-dunyayi-dar-edecemiz-4545599>)

F. State Policies Promoting Torture and Ill-Treatment

99. Following the coup attempt, widespread arrests occurred. Soldiers, police officers, judges, professors, and civilians were among those arrested. On the one hand, many people were reported to have been tortured and ill-treated during detention, while in overcrowded prisons, prisoners were subjected to ill-treatment and inhumane conditions, were denied adequate health care, and were subjected to physical violence. From 2016 until the present, documented incidences of torture and ill-treatment of members of the Gülen movement have appeared in the media and been included in national and international reports.⁹⁸

⁹³ <https://hatemonitoring.com/report-of-sabah-newspaper/>

⁹⁴ <https://hatemonitoring.com/suat-bezengs-twitter-post/>

⁹⁵ <https://hatemonitoring.com/oktan-erdikmens-statement-2/>

⁹⁶ Disinformation: Gulen movement hasn't been listed an extremist group in Germany. The mentioned report is available [here](#)

⁹⁷ <https://hatemonitoring.com/hakan-fidans-statement/>

⁹⁸ 'A Blank Check : Turkey's Post-Coup Suspension of Safeguards Against Torture' Human Rights Watch (2016) [report](#); 'Amnesty International Report 2016/17 – Turkey' Amnesty International (2017) [report](#); UN's special rapporteur on torture Nils Melzer's [statements](#) (2016); [Report](#) by the European Committee for the Prevention of Torture and Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CPT) in 2017; [Report](#) on the impact of the state of emergency on human rights in Turkey, Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (2018)

100. Despite technically lifting the state of emergency, the Erdoğan dictatorship continues to jail hundreds of people for suspected involvement in the Gülen movement on a weekly basis⁹⁹. Torture and other forms of ill-treatment have occurred during these detentions. This worrying scenario is still reflected in the impartial reports of international organisations.¹⁰⁰

F.1 Turkey Tribunal

101. Turkey Tribunal is an independent citizen effort founded in 2021 to chronicle and publicize the growing number of human rights breaches in Turkey following the attempted coup in 2016¹⁰¹. While not an official judicial entity, the Tribunal takes testimony from victims and witnesses, writes reports, and makes decisions. Human rights advocates and lawyers support the Tribunal's work, which draws attention to significant abuses like as detentions, arrests, torture, and ill-treatment. It bases its work on reports from organizations such as Human Rights Watch and Amnesty International, and it seeks to promote awareness by conveying these information to the global public.

102. In 2021, the Turkey Tribunal in Geneva conducted a thorough investigation into cases of torture and ill-treatment in Turkey. Witness accounts and expert investigations confirmed systematic torture, particularly against members of the Gülen movement and Kurdish political groupings. According to the Tribunal, Turkey failed to take adequate procedures to prevent and investigate torture, in violation of its international law duties¹⁰². The Turkey Tribunal determined that activities such as torture and enforced disappearances in Turkey were part of a broad and systematic onslaught on people and may be considered crimes against humanity. The Tribunal submitted its findings to the International Criminal Court (ICC) to ensure that those responsible for human rights crimes are held accountable.

103. OTHERS and INACH are alarmed by the widespread reports of torture and ill-treatment of individuals, particularly members of the Gülen movement, following the 2016 coup attempt in Türkiye. Despite the lifting of the state of emergency, the Erdoğan regime continues to detain and mistreat hundreds of people weekly, with documented incidences appearing in national and international reports.

⁹⁹ Up-to-date '[Mass Detention Database](#)' prepared by Solidarity with Others

¹⁰⁰ '[Report](#) on Allegations of systemic torture and inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment in places of detention in Europe' Parliamentary Assembly of Council of Europe (2023)

¹⁰¹ About [Turkey Tribunal](#)

¹⁰² [Reports](#) of Turkey Tribunal (2021)

G. Conclusion and Recommendations

103. OTHERS and INACH are honored to submit this report to the Committee Against Torture (CAT), highlighting the pervasive issue of hate speech and its significant impact on human rights violations in Turkey. The report details the correlation between hate speech, particularly targeting the Gulen movement, and the rise in instances of torture, cruel, inhuman, or degrading treatment or punishment. This systematic discrimination, exacerbated by political rhetoric and media amplification, has created a hostile environment that legitimizes and perpetuates human rights abuses.

104. To address the significant concerns expressed in this report and assure Turkey's compliance with the Convention Against Torture, OTHERS and INACH request the Committee to:

- **Turkey should provide detailed steps and progress on investigating incidents of torture and ill-treatment, particularly those targeting members of the Gulen movement. Ensure that these investigations are thorough, impartial, and lead to accountability for perpetrators.**
- **Turkey should implement stringent regulations against hate speech within its legal framework, specifically targeting language that incites violence and discrimination against minority groups.**
- **Turkey should provide adequate protection and support for victims of hate speech-crime and related human rights violations, including psychological and legal assistance. Ensure that these protections are accessible to all affected individuals, regardless of their political or social affiliations.**